

**OHIO ADVISORY COMMITTEE TO  
THE U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS  
MEETING MINUTES**

January 19, 2017

The Ohio Advisory Committee to the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights (Committee) convened via teleconference to discuss civil rights concerns in the State. Diane Citrino chaired the meeting and performed the initial roll call of committee members present. The meeting was open to the public and took place from 4:00pm – 5:00pm EST.

**State Advisory Committee Members:**

**Present:**

1. Citrino, Diane (Chair)
2. Bledsoe, Cassandra
3. Forte, David
4. Tryon, David
5. Thrower, Edith
6. Hernandez, Emerald
7. Strang, Lee
8. Strasser, Mark
9. Salem, Robert
10. Gerber, Scott
11. Chandra, Subodh

**Absent:**

1. Burstion-Donbraye, Deborah
2. Crosby, Catherine
3. Davies, Sharon
4. McDermott, Kevin

**Commission Staff present:**

- Mussatt, David
- Wojnaroski, Melissa (DFO)
- Barreras, David

**Members of the Public present:**

- None identified

**Meeting Notes/Decisions Made:**

**Approval of Minutes**

- David Forte moved to approve minutes from the Committee's December 20, 2016 meeting as drafted;
- Scott Gerber seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously by a voice vote.

**Discussion**

- Draft Committee Report: Human Trafficking in Ohio
  - Edith Thrower moved to remove the first sentence of the Executive Summary, which reads: "The trafficking of persons is described by many as a "modern or Twenty-First Century form of slavery." (see Thrower memo, attached, for discussion)
    - Mark Strasser seconded the motion.

- The motion failed by a voice vote, with a count of 2 in favor and 9 opposed:
        1. Citrino – no
        2. Bledsoe – no
        3. Chandra – no
        4. Forte – no
        5. Gerber – no
        6. Salem – no
        7. Hernandez – no
        8. Strang – no
        9. Strasser – yes
        10. Thrower – yes
        11. Tryon – no
    - The Committee reviewed the remainder of the draft report, with changes incorporated following the December 20, 2016 meeting (see attached). The discussion yielded the following additional amendments:
      - Section C.1 beginning on p. 17: the first sentence was edited to read: “Ohio continues to have a severe problem with human trafficking.”
      - Finding #2 on page 24 was modified to read: “Many fail to recognize...” (strike: “It appears that there may be a failure among many to recognize...”).
      - Finding #2 on page 24, the final sentence was also modified to read: “More needs to be done...” (strike “It appears that more needs to be done...”)
      - Recommendation 1d was edited to read “Uniform standards of care should be implemented by victim services agencies, ...” (strike “The Ohio Uniform Standards of Care...”)
      - Recommendation 1g was edited to read: “Consistent with 42 other states...” (strike: “In consistency with...”)
      - Recommendation 1g(ii) was deleted
    - David Forte moved to accept changes to the draft report as discussed.
      - Scott Gerber seconded the motion.
      - Subodh Chandra introduced a friendly amendment to allow additional minor editorial changes as appropriate, such as removing passive voice (see for example, recommendation 1d). The motion was modified accordingly.
      - The motion passed unanimously by a voice vote.
- Report completion: The following tasks remain outstanding before the Committee’s report may be published:
  - USCCR Staff will share a draft copy of the report with all panelists, asking them to review for accuracy and provide any relevant updates to their testimony.
  - An updated draft will be forwarded to the USCCR Office of General Counsel (OGC) for Legal Sufficiency Review (LSR).
    - USCCR Staff encouraged Committee members to review the report’s recommendations one more time, and make appropriate edits to ensure

that all recommendations are: (1) directed toward the Commission; (2) include specific and actionable tasks for the Commission; (3) where appropriate, include at least some recommendations involving implicated federal agencies, such as the USDOJ. Such revisions may help facilitate a more expeditious LSR.

- Proposal: Barriers to Equal Access to Education in Ohio
  - The Committee began discussion of their next project topic, Barriers to Equal Access to Education in Ohio.
    - Prior to project implementation, the Committee will need to develop a complete project proposal, and receive approval of that proposal from the Office of the Staff Director.
    - A sample project proposal from another Advisory Committee was provided to the Committee for review (Indiana: Civil Rights and the School to Prison Pipeline)
  - The Committee discussed including the following topics for consideration in their study of Barriers to Equal Access to Education in Ohio:
    - Title IX
      - A review of Title IX implementation in Ohio: including matters of hostile work environment, sexual assault, etc., in addition to measures to ensure equal access to athletic funding;
        - Transgender issues; sexuality and gender identity
        - Due process; adjudication under violations of Title 9
    - Additional Potential Barriers to Education in Ohio:
      - Family issues
      - Lack of Choice in Education Providers
      - Lack of Choice in Education Paths
      - Transportation issues
      - Collective Bargaining Agreements
      - DeRolph Litigation impact on school funding
      - Widespread use of school vouchers impact on race and religion; Zelman v. Simmons-Harris
      - Re-segregation of schools
      - Wider access to high quality early childhood programs
    - Subodh Chandra recused himself from the present discussion due questions regarding potential conflicts of interest. Requested legal guidance from OGC regarding his future/continued participation in the Committee's study.
  - USCCR staff will begin drafting a project proposal based on the Committee's discussion;
    - Committee members were encouraged to submit additional ideas for consideration to the Chair and the DFO via email in advance of the next meeting;
    - Additional discussion may be necessary at the next meeting prior to the proposal's completion.

Open Comment:

- At the conclusion of the meeting public lines were opened for comment; no public comment was received.

Future Plans and Actions:

- The Committee Chair requested nominations for the position of vice- Chair, to serve as necessary in the absence of the Chair. Further discussion will take place at the Committee's next meeting, TBD.

Adjournment

- Scott Gerber moved to adjourn the meeting at 5:05pm EST; David Tryon seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously by a voice-vote.

Next Meeting:

- TBD; USCCR staff will poll Committee members for their availability.